A Reviewer Learns the Fruitlessness of a New Research Project

Author(s)

Elysa Koppelman
Caroline Whitbeck

Year

2000

Description

A scenario about a researcher who, after reviewing a journal article, realizes that his collaborative project is fruitless.

Body

You have thought of a new model that you see as leading to a promising new line of research in your field. To carry out your investigation of the model you need collaborators with some complementary skills. After much ground work you convince a rather prestigious group at another university to collaborate with you in this research.

You are collaboratively writing the grant proposal when you receive a journal article to review. The research reported in the article is very exciting, but it shows that your model cannot be right. You do not see any way to alter your model to circumvent the problems you now see with it. You realize that going forward with the project will be fruitless.

- What, if anything, can and should you say to your would-be collaborators?
- Perhaps there is a way to alter your model that you just don't see. How, if at all, can you approach other team members about altering it?

Variant: Suppose that you are the editor of the journal, rather than the reviewer of the article, and the reviewer asks you for guidance.

Notes

Caroline Whitbeck introduced methods and modules for discussing numerous issues in responsible conduct of research at a Sigma Xi Forum in 2000. Partial funding for the development of this material came from an NIH grant.

You can find the entire sequence on the OEC at [Scenarios for Ethics Modules in the Responsible Conduct of Research](#). Some information in these historical modules may be out-of-date; for instance, there may be a new edition of the professional society's code that is referred to in an item. If you have suggestions for updates, please contact the OEC.

Contributor(s)

Caroline Whitbeck

Rights

Use of Materials on the OEC

Resource Type

Open-ended scenario

Parent Collection

Scenarios for Ethics Modules in the Responsible Conduct of Research

Topics

Intellectual Property and Patents
Peer Review
Publication Ethics
Research and Practice

Discipline(s)

Computer, Math, and Physical Sciences
Engineering
Life and Environmental Sciences
Research Ethics
Social and Behavioral Sciences

Publisher

Online Ethics Center